

## REMARKS

Claim 12 has been amended to more clearly define the invention. More particularly, Claim 12 has been amended to recite that the scale-collector provides a surface upon which scale can form that is separate from the mesh material provided with a frame. Page 7, lines 24-30 of the specification is considered to provide support for this amendment.

The rejection of Claims 2-3,5-6 and 10-12 under 35 U.S.C. 102(B) as anticipated by Trably is considered to lack merit.

Trably is not considered to teach, or even suggest, the filter defined by even Claim 12, the most generic claim.

Unlike the filter defined by Claim 12, the filter of Trably does not have a scale collector that provides a surface upon which scale can form that is separate with the mesh material provided with a frame.

In the filter of Trably removal of scale is provided by mechanical filtration between two filter cloths that are spaced apart which is quite different, and clearly not even suggestive, of a scale collector having a surface to which scale is attracted as in the claimed filter.

The rejection of Claims 2-6, 9 and 12 under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as anticipated by Heligman is considered to lack merit.

Heligman is not considered to teach, or even suggest, the filter defined by Claim 12, the most generic claim.

Unlike the filter defined by Claim 12, the filter of Heligman

does not have a scale collector provided with a surface upon which scale can form. Instead, in the filter of Heligman, scale is removed by a filter media (52) formed of particles that foreign matter such as odor, undesired taste as well as scale, positioned between two planar mesh screens (48) and (50).

The Rejection of Claims 4, 7 and 9 under 35 U.S.C. 103 (a) as unpatentable over Trably in view of Heligman is considered to lack merit.

For reasons given in regard to parent Claim 12, neither Trably nor Heligman taken alone, or even in combination, is considered to even suggest the filter defined by the instant claims.

An early allowance of the claims and case is requested.

Respectfully submitted,

By Norman N. Spain  
Norman N. Spain, Reg. 17,846  
Consulting Patent Attorney  
(914) 333-9625

**CERTIFICATE OF MAILING**

It is hereby certified that this correspondence is being deposited with the United States Postal Service as first-class mail in an envelope addressed to:

COMMISSIONER OF PATENTS AND TRADEMARKS  
Washington, D.C. 20231

On July 19, 2001

By Norman N. Spain